

BRITISH MEDICAL JOURNAL

DR
42

SATURDAY 18 JUNE 1983

LEADING ARTICLES

- Arthritis in young children BARBARA M ANSELL 1917
Blood counts and economics T J HAMBLIN 1918
Urticarial vasculitis ROBERT P WARIN 1919
Regular Review: Venous ulceration N L BROWSE 1920

CLINICAL RESEARCH • PAPERS AND SHORT REPORTS • PRACTICE OBSERVED

- Genital oedema in patients treated by continuous ambulatory peritoneal dialysis: an unusual presentation of inguinal hernia
J C COOPER, A J NICHOLLS, J M SIMMS, M M PLATTS, C B BROWN, A G JOHNSON 1923
Cold pressor test in diagnosis of coronary artery disease: echophonocardiographic method
BASIL I B SENEVIRATNE, IAN LINTON, ROGER WILKINSON, WILLIAM ROWE, MARY SPICE 1924
Randomised controlled comparative study of methyl dopa and oxprenolol in treatment of hypertension in pregnancy
JACK FIDLER, VALERIE SMITH, PETER FAYERS, MICHAEL DE SWIET 1927
Increasing incidence and mortality from myocardial infarction in Stockholm county LARS ALFREDSSON, ANDERS AHLBOM 1931
Screening the newborn for Duchenne muscular dystrophy: parents' views MELINDA A FIRTH, ELIZABETH J WILKINSON 1933
Postoperative analgesia for circumcision J WHITE, B HARRISON, P RICHMOND, A PROCTER, J CURRAN 1934
Isosorbide dinitrate and isoxsuprine in exercise induced asthma W M TULLETT, K R PATEL 1934
Dysphagia: a further symptom of hypercalcaemia? R J GRIEVE, P F DIXON 1935
Dietary lactose and the child with abdominal pain J DEARLOVE, B DEARLOVE, K PEARL, R PRIMAVESI 1936
Radiological prevalence of Paget's disease in Dunedin, New Zealand J C REASBECK, A GOULDING, D R CAMPBELL, L R BEALE, R D H STEWART 1937
Aluminium hydroxide intake: real risk of aluminium toxicity J B CANNATA, J D BRIGGS, B J R JUNOR, G S FELL 1937
Neuroleptic malignant syndrome ROSEMARIE V COPE, ELIZABETH M GREGG 1938
Practice Research: Should general practitioners use dithranol? JUDITH DONALDSON, W J CUNLIFFE 1939
Practising Prevention: Health education officer S A SMAIL 1941

MEDICAL PRACTICE

- Artificial ventilation for neurological disease: retrospective analysis 1972-81 J G DOUGLAS, R J FERGUSON, G K CROMPTON, I W B GRANT 1943
Aviation Medicine: Aviation psychology II: Assessing workload and selecting pilots ROGER GREEN 1947
New Drugs: Hypnotics and anxiolytics N HOCKINGS, BRIAN R BALLINGER 1949
ABC of Computing: Auxiliary storage A J ASBURY 1952
Erythromycin estolate and jaundice WILLIAM H W INMAN, NIGEL S B RAWSON 1954
Outside Europe: Reasons for failure of antihypertensive treatment O OGUNYEMI 1956
Promotion of exercise at work J A MUIR GRAY, ARCHIE YOUNG, JOHN R ENNIS 1958
Lesson of the Week: Aortic stenosis and systemic hypertension D G BEEVERS, P J M SLOAN, J MACKINNON 1960
Letter from Chicago: Swallowing the golden ball GEORGE DUNEA 1962
Any Questions? 1946, 1955, 1957, 1963
Materia Non Medica—Contributions from IRIS I J M GIBSON, RUTH HOLLAND, MARGARET A FORWELL 1961
Medicine and Books 1964
Medicine and the Media—Contributions from JOHN GRABINAR, TESSA RICHARDS 1968
Personal View JIM NEWMARK 1969

CORRESPONDENCE—List of Contents 1970

OBITUARY 1986

NEWS AND NOTES

- Views 1981
Medical Birthday Honours 1982
Medicolegal 1982
Medical News 1983
BMA Notices 1984
One Man's Burden MICHAEL O'DONNELL 1985

SUPPLEMENT

- The Week 1990
Conference of medical academic representatives 1991
Reporting colleagues to the General Medical Council 1994
Annual hospital conferences 1995
Registrars and senior house officers in post in the Trent
Region in 1982 GILLIAN B TODD, KATIE B SHELDRIK 1997

CORRESPONDENCE

Antidepressant effects of electroconvulsive therapy G J Pohlen, FRANZCP	1970
Statistical assessment of papers submitted to the "British Medical Journal" R S Jones, FRCP	1971
New drugs: modern diuretic treatment A Rozkovec, MRCP, and A J Marshall, MD; D Jackson, MB; R W S Brooks, MRCP, and A E S Ritch, MRCP	1971
New drugs: beta blockers and sympathomimetics J Feely, MD, and D Maclean, FRCP	1972
Low dose thiazide combined with a beta blocker G A C Grell, FRCP	1972
Informed consent R J Simes, MD, and M H N Tattersall, FRACP; A Grant, MRCOG, and I Chalmers, MRCOG	1972
Antivivisection Judith E Hampson, PHD; S Britten, MRCPsych; H B Hewitt, MD	1973
The needle necropsy E W Benbow, MB; M S Kearney, MD	1974
Use of cephalixin to treat glandular fever P J Williamson, MB, and P M Hawkey, MD; J Lakic, LRCP; P M Elwin, MB	1974
One man's burden M O'Donnell, MB	1975

Clinical and biochemical manifestations of digoxin toxicity C M Byatt, MB; M Sonnenblick, MD, and others	1975
Digitalis intoxication M G Thorne, FRCP, and C E Bowman, MRCP	1975
Spontaneous abortions in hospital sterilising staff Jane E Gordon, PHD, and T J Meinhardt, MSPH; Susan G Austin, DSC; K Hemminki, MD, and others	1976
Recurrent oesophageal stricture due to tuberculosis J P Milnes, MRCP, and G K T Holmes, MD	1977
Should children with Down's syndrome be advised not to use trampolines? J Wilson, FRCP	1977
Studies comparing methods of measuring blood pressure E C Coles, MFCM, and R G Newcombe, PHD	1977
Effect of environment on blood pressure K A Cleur, MRCP; M A Young, MRCP	1978
Should homosexuals be vaccinated against hepatitis B virus? M R Hamilton-Farrell, MRCP; J J Jones, MFCM	1978
Identical twins with identical vesicoureteric reflux C G Winearls, MRCP, and C R K Hind, MRCP	1978

Treatment of angina pectoris with nifedipine J R Idle, PHD, and P S Sever, MRCP	1978
Infant chlamydial pneumonia J F Price, MRCP, and P Morgan-Capner, MRCPATH	1979
Michelin woman in Nepal Ann B Sandison, MB	1979
The MRCGP examination and accident and emergency departments O Ahmed, MB	1979
Points Hours half on call? (P Cartwright); Therapeutic abortion and chlamydial infection (H Wagman, and S Sellappah); Treatment of bacterial meningitis (C H Dash);	1979
Effect of doxapram on heavy sedation produced by intravenous diazepam (G Scollo-Lavizzari); Hypothyroidism presenting with hyperprolactinaemia (F Mills); Tuberculosis in unvaccinated children, adolescents, and young adults (D K Stevenson); Do Americans have athlete's foot? (Rosemary E Taylor); Missed jaundice in black infants (S Ghosh); New drugs: antiarrhythmic drugs (H Yarrow); Successful treatment of herpes labialis with topical acyclovir (B E Juel-Jensen); Galactorrhoea as a side effect of domperidone (K J Van Acker); What is the best way to replace your anal sphincter? (E M Barker)	1980

We may return unduly long letters to the author for shortening so that we can offer readers as wide a selection as possible. We receive so many letters each week that we have to omit some of them. Letters should be typed with double spacing between lines and must be signed personally by all their authors, who should include their degrees. Letters critical of a paper may be sent to the authors of the paper so that their reply may appear in the same issue.

Antidepressant effects of electroconvulsive therapy

SIR,—Dr J F W Deakin's review of recent research into the antidepressant effects of electroconvulsive therapy (2 April, p 1083) and the comments by Dr C L Katona and Dr C R Aldridge (30 April, p 1443) focus attention on the roles of high energy stimulation and seizure duration in treatment effectiveness. These factors may help to explain the experience of psychiatrists who have found bilateral electrode placement more effective than unilateral electrode placement.^{1 2}

Bilateral treatment has been strongly criticised on clinical grounds.³ Psychiatrists who use it have been accused of poor clinical practice and ignorance⁴ and a lack of awareness of current research findings.⁵ These are unlikely explanations for the use of bilateral electrodes in three of the four recent studies of depression, in which real and simulated electroconvulsive therapy were compared and in the work of Robin and de Tissera reviewed by Dr Deakin. This condemnation was precipitated by a report to the Royal College of Psychiatrists, which concluded: "In neither depression nor schizophrenia is there a significant difference between the results of unilateral and bilateral electroconvulsive therapy."²

The college report classified the outcomes of unilateral and bilateral electroconvulsive therapy agreed by both doctor and patient as good (defined as "great improvement"), fair ("moderate improvement"), poor ("little or no improvement") and worse. The table shows the results for depression given in table 18 of the report (percentages in parentheses). The proportion of good results with bilateral electroconvulsive therapy was significantly higher than with unilateral ($\chi^2=6.37$, $df=1$,

$p<0.02$). The difference between all classes of outcome was also significant, though it was dominated by fair results which were proportionally higher with unilateral ($\chi^2=8.64$, $df=3$, $p<0.05$). Under the conditions studied bilateral electroconvulsive therapy was a significantly more effective treatment for depression than unilateral electroconvulsive therapy. The results for schizophrenia given in the report were similar in distribution but the numbers were much lower and differences of statistical significance were not given.

The authors of the report avoided these two variations of the chi square test (which were used to show other statistical differences) and failed to provide an alternative test of significance to support their conclusion. Apparently the good and fair results were classed together on the basis that they indicated some degree of recovery after electroconvulsive therapy. This approach is not acceptable for three reasons. Firstly, "great improvements" in psychiatric illness (which were classed as good in the report) tend to be outstanding and readily recognisable whereas "moderate improvements" (fair) are less clearly identified; indeed all of the 1066 results classed as good for depression were agreed by doctor and patient, but a third of the 672 classed as fair were not. Secondly, the necessarily

crude assessment of "moderate improvement" in the report fails to meet adequate standards of scientific reliability. Thirdly, the proportion of fair results (33% for unilateral and 25% for bilateral) is comparable with the proportion of depressed patients that has responded to placebo effects elsewhere,⁶ responses that did not escape Dr Deakin's review.

Papers in the *BMJ* continue to emphasise the care that should be taken in assessing the use and meaning of statistical tests in medical research (7 May, p 1485).⁷ The same care should be taken in considering the conclusion in the college report about the effectiveness of electrode placements in electroconvulsive therapy. That conclusion is statistically unsound and clinically misleading.

G J POHLEN

Macquarie Hospital, Sydney,
New South Wales 2113,
Australia

¹ American Psychiatric Association Task Force. Electroconvulsive therapy. Report 14. Washington: American Psychiatric Association 1978:200.

² Pippard J, Ellum L. Electroconvulsive treatment in Great Britain 1980. London: Gaskell (Royal College of Psychiatrists) 1981:162.

³ Kiloh LG. Electroconvulsive therapy. In: Paykel ES, ed. *Handbook of affective disorders*. Edinburgh: Churchill Livingstone 1982:262-75.

⁴ Anonymous. ECT in Britain: a shameful state of affairs. *Lancet* 1981;ii:1207-8.

⁵ Carson JA, Findlay ES, Grigor JMG. Electroconvulsive therapy. A Victorian survey. *Aust Clin Rev* 1983 March: 16-9.

⁶ Greenblatt M, Grosser GH, Wechsler H. Differential response of hospitalised depressed patients to somatic therapy. *Am J Psychiatry* 1964;120:935-43.

⁷ Gore MS, Altman DG. *Statistics in practice*. London: British Medical Association 1982:100.

Results of electroconvulsive therapy in patients with depression

	Good No (%)	Fair No (%)	Poor No (%)	Worse No (%)	Total No
Unilateral	207 (58)	117 (33)	31 (9)	1 (1)	356
Bilateral	827 (65)	320 (25)	110 (9)	7 (1)	1264