

BRITISH MEDICAL JOURNAL

U. S. DEPT. OF AGRICULTURE
NATIONAL AGRICULTURAL LIBRARY
RECEIVED

MAR 15 1985

PROCUREMENT SECTION
CURRENT SERIAL RECORDS
SATURDAY 2 MARCH 1985

LEADING ARTICLES

Pros and cons of continuous subcutaneous insulin infusion	P J WATKINS	655
Deaths of athletes	MARK HARRIES	656
Management of delayed puberty	CHARLES G D BROOK	657
Regular Review: Graft versus host diseases: new versions of old problems?	A M DENMAN	658

CLINICAL RESEARCH • PAPERS AND SHORT REPORTS • PRACTICE OBSERVED

Fetal haematology in rhesus isoimmunisation	K H NICOLAIDES, C H RODECK, D S MILLAR, R S MIBASHAN	661
Hepatitis B virus DNA and e antigen in serum from blood donors in the United Kingdom positive for hepatitis B surface antigen	T J HARRISON, V BAL, E G WHEELER, T J MEACOCK, J F HARRISON, A J ZUCKERMAN	663
Is bile acid malabsorption underdiagnosed? An evaluation of accuracy of diagnosis by measurement of SeHCAT retention	M V MERRICK, M A EASTWOOD, M J FORD	665
Older women's attitudes towards breast disease, self examination, and screening facilities: implications for communication	D S LEATHER, M M ROBERTS	668
Blood group as a prognostic indicator in breast cancer	P J HOLDSWORTH, J THOROGOOD, E A BENSON, A D CLAYDEN	671
Unithiol in Wilson's disease	J M WALSH	673
Bronchoconstriction in response to suggestion: its prevention by an inhaled anticholinergic agent	J E NEILD, I R CAMERON	674
Hydralazine induced lupus syndrome with eye disease	MICHAEL DOHERTY, PETER J MADDISON, RODNEY H B GREY	675
Onycholysis associated with cytotoxic drugs	DAVID CUNNINGHAM, NIGEL L GILCHRIST, GORDON J FORREST, MICHAEL SOUKOP	675
Cortical blindness complicating Wegener's granulomatosis	COLIN D PAYTON, J M BOULTON JONES	676
Shuttle case records: link between general practice and the specialist unit	JANNIE M BEYER, KIM HØRSLEV-PETERSEN, PEKKA HELIN	677

MEDICAL PRACTICE

Prometheus the impostor	NATHANIEL LAOR	681
For Debate: The COMA report: what it left out	J T WINKLER	685
Lesson of the Week: A narrow escape from splenectomy	LYDIA JONES, SALLY N DAVIES, A C NEWLAND, G C JENKINS	687
Paediatrics among Ethnic Minorities: Contact with the health services	JOHN BLACK	689
Control of diarrhoeal disease in Tonga 1978-83	DAVID J CLOW	691
Plastic and Reconstructive Surgery: Craniofacial surgery	M POOLE, M BRIGGS, J RAYNE, H CHENG	693
Public Health Laboratory Service: Tetanus surveillance: England and Wales, 1981-3		696
Medicolegal: The Gee case: judge rules on meanings of words	CLARE DYER	698
Needs and Opportunities in Rehabilitation: Rehabilitation after stroke: 1—What is the potential?	DAPHNE GLOAG	699
CSM Update		702
Any Questions?		684, 688, 690, 692, 701, 707
Materia Non Medica—Contribution from DAVID H WOODHEAD		697
Medicine and Books		703
What's new in the new editions?	CLIFFORD HAWKINS	705
Medicine and the Media—Contribution from IAN J DEARY		707
Personal View	RICHARD WILSON	708

CORRESPONDENCE—List of Contents	709
---------------------------------	-----

OBITUARY	719
----------	-----

NEWS AND NOTES

Views	715
Medical News	716
BMA Notices	717
One Man's Burden	MICHAEL O'DONNELL 718

SUPPLEMENT

The Week	721
Powell Bill on embryo research precipitate, says minister	
WILLIAM RUSSELL	722
From the GMSC: Negotiators to consider regulations on limited list	723
Mr Fowler's statement on limited list	724
Limited list of medicinal products available in the NHS after 1 April 1985	725
BMA studies effects on research of UGC cuts	726

CORRESPONDENCE

AIDS guidelines too stringent A J Pinching, MRCP, and others.	709	Can we afford screening for neural tube defects? K Spencer, MSC, and P Carpenter, FIMLS; J B Henderson, MSC.	711	Infection with parvovirus during pregnancy Susan Hall, MFCM.	713
Limited lists of drugs: lessons from abroad J C Sanders.	710	Value of computed tomography in patients with stroke M Joglekar, MB, and K Mohanaruban, MRCP; P Sandercock, MRCP, and others.	712	"Tissue thyrotoxicosis" P E Jennings, MRCP, and others.	714
The world cancer burden P R J Burch, PHD.	710	Hydrofluoric acid burns K C Judkins, FFARCS; J R B Cooper, AFOM.	713	Long term follow up of untreated primary hyperparathyroidism A D Chyc, MB.	714
Mentally ill offenders in prison J Gunn, FRCPsych.	710	Chemotherapy for small cell lung cancer N B N Ibrahim, MRCPATH.	713	Part time senior registrar training Cynthia M Illingworth, FRCP.	714
Preventing infant deaths M D Jewell, MRCP, and others; A Nicoll, MRCP; S Hodges, MRCP.	710			Media drug campaigns may be worse than a waste of time J Patten, MP.	714
Failure of single dose amoxycillin as prophylaxis against endocarditis D C Shanson, MRCPATH.	711				

Because we receive many more letters than we have room to publish we may shorten those that we do publish to allow readers as wide a selection as possible. In particular, when we receive several letters on the same topic we reserve the right to abridge individual letters. Our usual policy is to reserve our correspondence columns for letters commenting on issues discussed recently (within six weeks) in the BMJ.

Letters critical of a paper may be sent to the authors of the paper so that their reply may appear in the same issue. We may also forward letters that we decide not to publish to the authors of the paper on which they comment.

Letters should not exceed 400 words and should be typed double spaced and signed by all authors, who should include their main degree.

AIDS guidelines too stringent

SIR,—Following your leading article on the acquired immune deficiency syndrome (AIDS) and the health care professions (23 February, p 583) we want to make some additional comments about the guidelines published by the Advisory Committee on Dangerous Pathogens (ACDP). This document was drawn up after consultations at a working group of the ACDP. We were the only members of that group, or of the full committee, who had looked after patients with AIDS or other manifestations of infection with human T lymphotropic virus type III (HTLV-III) or worked in routine and research laboratories handling specimens from such patients.

The final document did not fully take account of our views, and, although much of it is sensible, its recommendations for the handling of samples in clinical laboratories are more stringent than those that have been satisfactorily in operation for several years in the United States, where category 2 (hepatitis B type) containment is applied. In the USA over 8000 cases of AIDS have been cared for together with perhaps five times as many patients with persistent generalised lymphadenopathy and other HTLV-III related disorders. There have been no validated cases of AIDS that have occurred as a result of occupational exposure. Most cases of AIDS among health care personnel have occurred in those who have other risk factors. Several hundred staff who have sustained needle stick injuries or have had major blood exposure have been followed up for long periods. All remain well and are seronegative for HTLV-III. In view of these facts the scientific validity of the ACDP guidelines needs to be questioned.

Category 3 containment, as suggested in the guidelines, is largely designed to protect against aerosol exposure, but there is no

evidence that infection can be contracted by this means and no reason to expect that routine clinical samples will contain high titres of infective virus. This degree of containment provides no extra protection against inoculation injury, which is clearly the most important hazard. For samples from any patient the only protection is good technique, with special emphasis on avoidance of inoculation injury. The exclusion of class II safety cabinets for work on clinical material from HTLV-III infected subjects is at variance with the ACDP's recommendations for all other pathogens for which category 3 containment applies. This restriction lacks scientific justification and could jeopardise clinical, diagnostic, and research work that depends on avoidance of sample contamination.

If the current guidelines were to offer maximal staff protection without impinging on patient care we would be prepared to accept the reasoning behind them in order to help alleviate the understandable concerns of laboratory and clinical staff. But if these excessively stringent precautions (which will be costly to implement) were to make it impossible to manage patients adequately, we think it mandatory that they should be modified to accord with a level of containment that can be justified scientifically. We are concerned that patient care could be compromised as a result of adopting unnecessarily stringent and costly precautions. On the predicted new patient case load for 1985 alone (some 400 AIDS cases and about 2000 patients with persistent generalised lymphadenopathy) we can expect that all teaching hospitals and many district general hospitals in the UK will be caring for such patients. It is unrealistic to imagine that this workload could be absorbed by a few specialist centres that can implement the guidelines, even though

some of them will continue to bear a disproportionately heavy burden by virtue of serving communities with many high risk individuals. We know of several hospitals, including teaching hospitals, that have sought to transfer patients to other centres because their laboratory staff are not prepared or not able to offer a basic diagnostic service for these patients. Such problems and attitudes ill befit us as health care professionals.

Another recommendation in the guidelines is that "those who may be directly exposed to the body fluids and tissues of AIDS patients . . . should be asked to volunteer blood samples . . . and arrangements should be made to test these sera for the presence of HTLV-III antibody." We do not feel that such testing is appropriate in the light of limited knowledge on the natural history of infection and when the reliability of current assays has not been fully assessed. Until both are clearer samples should be stored. We suspect that the implications for an individual with a positive antibody test have not been fully appreciated; the intrusion into that staff member's personal life necessary to determine its importance would be considerable. In some specialties it could have major implications for that person's career, for which as yet no provision has been made.

We think that all health care workers, especially clinicians and laboratory managers, have a duty to ensure that no patient is allowed to suffer less than adequate care as a consequence of implementing the ACDP guidelines—nor indeed for any other reason. We must be given the resources to implement the proposals without delay, or the ACDP must revise its guidelines to accord with the scientific evidence and the much greater experience in the USA. We regard this as an important area for open debate so that we can achieve an acceptable balance between the