

448.8  
77  
22

# BRITISH MEDICAL JOURNAL

SATURDAY 4 OCTOBER 1986

## LEADING ARTICLES

Death after bereavement	BRIAN R MCAVOY	835
Hyperplastic anaemia and parvovirus infection	D P BENTLEY	836
Normal pressure hydrocephalus	MILNE ANDERSON	837

## CLINICAL RESEARCH • PAPERS AND SHORT REPORTS • PRACTICE OBSERVED

Splenic irradiation in treating warm autoimmune haemolytic anaemia	H MARKUS, J C FORFAR	839
Metabolic abnormalities in children of non-insulin dependent diabetics	R D G LESLIE, H P VOLKMANN, M PONCHER, I HANNING, H ORSKOV, K G M M ALBERTI	840
Asthma and climatic conditions: experience from Bermuda, an isolated island community	M J CAREY, I CORDON	843
Mortality of workers at the Sellafield plant of British Nuclear Fuels	P G SMITH, A J DOUGLAS	845
Right superior vena cava draining into the left atrium with left superior vena cava draining into the right atrium	D LEYS, J MANOUVRIER, T DUPARD, P KASSIOTIS, C REY, P MARACHE, G DUCLOUX, H PETIT	855
Munchausen's syndrome by proxy: a warning for health professionals	LAWEH AMEGAVIE, OMNIA MARZOUK, JOHN MULLEN, JOHN SILLS, JEAN B M GAUTHIER LE TENDRE	855
Blowing hot and cold: "near miss" sudden infant death and episodic hypothermia	K P DUNNE, M MCKAY, T G MATTHEWS	856
Correction: Cigarette smoking	BARON ET AL	856
Effect on prescribing of the limited list in a computerised group practice	W G IRWIN, K A MILLS, K STEELE	857
Role of general practitioners in the care of disabled young adults	F S W BRIMBLECOMBE, D L KUH, C J LAWRENCE, R C SMITH	859

## MEDICAL PRACTICE

Injuries of the spine sustained during gymnastic activities	J R SILVER, D D SILVER, J J GODFREY	861
Sir Harry Platt: 100 not out	RICHARD SMITH	864
Private nursing homes: contribution to long stay care of the elderly in the Brighton Health District	J BENNETT	867
Cytotoxic chemotherapy for common adult malignancies: "the emperor's new clothes" revisited?	JOHN H KEARSLEY	871
Any Questions?		866, 870, 876
Clinical curio—Spurious ventricular tachycardia	M B BUCHALTER, E T WILLIAMS	866
Medicine and Books		877
Personal View	BENJAMIN LEE	880
Correction: Use and misuse of a digoxin assay service	GIBB ET AL	876

CORRESPONDENCE—List of Contents	881	OBITUARY	893
---------------------------------	-----	----------	-----

## NEWS AND NOTES

Views	889
Medical News	890
BMA Notices	891
One Man's Burden	MICHAEL O'DONNELL 892

## SUPPLEMENT

The Week	895
Survey of recently appointed consultants in geriatric medicine	896
WILLIAM H BARKER, JAMES WILLIAMSON	
LMC scheme to help sick doctors	899

## CORRESPONDENCE

<b>Immunity and depression</b>		<b>A complication of capillary glucose monitoring</b>		<b>Salaries of clinical academic staff</b>	
J C C Chase, MRCPsych . . . . .	881	I N Scobie, MRCP; I Martin-Scott, MD; N I Jowett, MD . . . . .	884	J P Payne, FFARCS . . . . .	886
<b>AIDS: act now, don't pay later</b>		<b>Clinical judgment rather than administrative directives</b>		<b>Points</b> Skin reactions to terfenadine (H C Masheter and M St G Wheeley); The perfect rabies vaccine (D T Langford and W M Shepherd); A case of scurvy (S Vallance); Obstetric anaesthetic services (W G Dawson; P F Franks and others); Obstetric care, social class, and maternal mortality (G J A Walker); Crisis in hospital pharmacy (J Maxwell); Epidemics of fractures during periods of snow and ice (S P Cembrowicz) . . . . .	887
M W Adler, FRCP; D Bhugra, MB . . . . .	882	CR Hart, FRCP . . . . .	884	Routine preventive measures and failure to attend appointments (J A C Winter); Heart disease in China (D C Snashall); A rise is a rise is a rise (I R Fletcher); Women in medicine (Neena Modi); Effect of biofeedback on patients' tolerance of fiberoptic bronchoscopy (C R Swinburn); Staying one jump ahead of the resistant <i>Staphylococcus aureus</i> (B S Azadian and D J M Wright; T H Pennington); Treatment of high blood pressure: should clinical practice be based on results of clinical trials? (G Rose); Medical defence subscriptions (I U Haq) . . . . .	888
<b>Psoriasis</b>		<b>Continuous ambulatory peritoneal dialysis fluid: another fluid positive for HIV antibody?</b>		<b>Correction: AIDS</b> (Van de Perre, Kestelyn, Sprecher) . . . . .	888
W F G Tucker, MB, and Sheila MacNeil, PHD . . . . .	882	P Williams, MRCP, and others . . . . .	885		
<b>Discrimination against singlehanded general practitioners</b>		<b>Incidence of rhesus immunisation after genetic amniocentesis</b>			
M Levy, MRCP, and R Pietroni, MRCP . . . . .	882	L A D Tovey, FRCPATH . . . . .	885		
<b>Programme for early detection of gastric cancer</b>		<b>New method of typing <i>Staphylococcus aureus</i> resistant to methicillin</b>			
P W J Houghton, FRCS, and others . . . . .	883	Georgia Duckworth, MRCP . . . . .	885		
<b>Manpower and women</b>		<b>Medical housing "lines"</b>			
Susan M Benbow, MRCPsych . . . . .	883	H S Kohli, MRCP . . . . .	885		
<b>Epidemics of fractures during periods of snow and ice</b>		<b>Recommendations on blood pressure measurement</b>			
Jill Meara, MB, and others . . . . .	883	I R Starkey, MRCP . . . . .	886		
<b>Bias in awarding research grants</b>		<b>Severe head injury: the first hour</b>			
J G Ball, FRCP . . . . .	883	M Adiseshiah, FRCS . . . . .	886		
<b>A case of scurvy</b>		<b>Obstetric anaesthetic services</b>			
M W P Carney, FRCPsych . . . . .	883	D A Buxton Hopkin, FFARCS . . . . .	886		
<b>The perfect rabies vaccine</b>		<b>Use of captopril in insulin dependent diabetics</b>			
G Harverson, FRCP . . . . .	884	D B Northridge, MRCP, and D M Fraser, FRCPED . . . . .	886		
<b>When things go wrong</b>					
F J Darby, MRCP . . . . .	884				
<b>Prognosis of patients discharged from a coronary care unit</b>					
M C Bateson, MD . . . . .	884				

Because we receive many more letters than we have room to publish we may shorten those that we do publish to allow readers as wide a selection as possible. In particular, when we receive several letters on the same topic we reserve the right to abridge individual letters. Our usual policy is to reserve our correspondence columns for letters commenting on issues discussed recently (within six weeks) in the BMJ.

Letters critical of a paper may be sent to the authors of the paper so that their reply may appear in the same issue.

We may also forward letters that we decide not to publish to the authors of the paper on which they comment.

Letters should not exceed 400 words and should be typed double spaced and signed by all authors, who should include their main degree.

## Immunity and depression

SIR,—I am concerned that Dr A M Denman concludes that there is little evidence of appreciably altered immunity in depressed subjects (23 August, p 464).

Physicians and psychiatrists who suspect that the mind and body may be more closely linked than we have yet been able to show will no doubt find this interesting. It is therefore surprising that there are only three studies of cellular immunity in depressed subjects. Of these, Dr Denman has quoted the work of Schieffer *et al* and Albrecht *et al*<sup>1,2</sup> but not the findings of Kronfol *et al*.<sup>3</sup> This is especially important as Kronfol and workers did find decreased proliferative responses in subjects who were less depressed than the patients of both Albrecht *et al* and Schieffer *et al*. This would argue that severity of depression alone cannot explain the findings. Any inference that might be drawn from the negative findings of Albrecht *et al* should be tempered by an awareness that their subjects were drug free for only one week.

A further criticism levelled at these studies was that they did not take into account diet, treatment, and life style. However, as with the earlier work of Bartrop *et al* and Schieffer *et al* on bereaved subjects,<sup>4,5</sup> they did consider drug intake. The part that diet, sleep disturbance, and exercise play in immunocompetence has been poorly tested. When done it was concentrated on extremes,<sup>6,8</sup> which are bound to cause physiological responses quite different from the disturbances that might be

expected in a moderately depressed subject. The problem is undoubtedly complex, but when found, lymphocyte depression has not correlated with dexamethasone treatment.<sup>2</sup> Recent work on the relation of immune function to sleep in man describes changes in natural killer cell and interleukin activity,<sup>13</sup> both of which seem to be independent of the diurnal cortisol rhythm. We clearly need to know a great deal more about the impact that sleep disturbance would have on subjects with morbid mental states.

Dr Denman's insistence that future study should analyse the responses more closely linked to relevant host defence is justified. To date no one has looked at more specific antimicrobial measures of immunity. In depressed subjects there has been only one study of subset ratios,<sup>2</sup> and its findings were negative. However, several studies have shown alteration in natural killer cell activity and altered ratios of helper to suppressor cells in times of stress.<sup>9,12</sup> Although anxiety and depression were not measured in these studies, one might well speculate about the Hamilton rating scale scores of such subjects.

It is clearly correct to question the pathophysiological relevance of depressed proliferative responses to mitogens. To imply that "there are those who believe that altered immunity predisposes to depression," however, is to misrepresent the views of those working in this subject. The work of Murphy and Brown<sup>14</sup> amply demon-

strates the caution with which psychiatrists approach the subject, and few of them suggest specious explanations for psychosomatic illness.

J C C CHASE

Department of Psychiatry,  
Middlesex Hospital,  
London W1N 8AA

- Schieffer SJ, Keller SE, Meyerson ST, Raskin MJ, Davis KL, Stein M. Lymphocyte function in major depressive disorder. *Arch Gen Psychiatry* 1984;41:484-6.
- Albrecht J, Helderman JH, Schlessner MA, Rush AJ. A controlled study of cellular immune function in affective disorders before and during somatic therapy. *Psychiatry Res* 1985;15:185-93.
- Kronfol Z, Silva J, Greden J, Dembinski S, Gardner R, Carroll B. Impaired lymphocyte function in depressive illness. *Life Sci* 1983;33:241-7.
- Bartrop RW, Luckhurst E, Lazerus L, Kilch LG, Penny R. Depressed lymphocyte function after bereavement. *Lancet* 1977;i:834-5.
- Schieffer SJ, Keller SE, Camerino M, Thornton JC, Stein M. Suppression of lymphocyte stimulation following bereavement. *JAMA* 1983;250:374-7.
- Palmblad J, Petrini B, Wasserman J, Akerstedt T. Lymphocyte and granulocyte reactions during sleep deprivation. *Psychosom Med* 1979;41:273-8.
- Gotch FM, Spry CJF, Mowat AG, Beeson PB, MacLennan ICM. Reversible granulocyte killing defect in anorexia nervosa. *Clin Exp Immunol* 1975;91:244-9.
- Eskola J, Ruuskanen O, Soppi E, Viljanen MK, Jarvinen M, Toivonen H. Effect of sport stress on lymphocyte transformation and antibody formation. *Clin Exp Immunol* 1978;32:339-5.
- Glaser R, Kiecolt-Glaser JK, Stout JC, Tarr KL, Speicher CE, Holliday JE. Stress related impairments in cellular immunity. *Psychiatry Res* 1986;16:233-9.