

BRITISH MEDICAL JOURNAL

SATURDAY 11 JULY 1987

LEADING ARTICLES

Refining thinking on type A behaviour and coronary heart disease	TOM SENSKY	69
Renal micropolyarteritis	A POLAK	70
Resuscitating resuscitation	R W G JOHNSON	71
Coventry: a no drinking-driving city by the year 2000?	COVENTRY SAFE DRIVING TEAM	71
Surgery of morbid obesity	J-C GAZET, T R E PILKINGTON	72
A shocking American report with lessons for all	T J HAMBLIN	73
AIDS: a faltering step	MICHAEL ADLER, D J JEFFRIES	73

CLINICAL RESEARCH • PAPERS AND SHORT REPORTS • PRACTICE OBSERVED

How much energy does the breast fed infant consume and expend?	A LUCAS, G EWING, S B ROBERTS, W A COWARD	75
IgA-Antigliadin antibodies in IgA mesangial nephropathy (Berger's disease)	A FORNASIERI, R A SINICO, P MALDIFASSI, P BERNASCONI, M VEGNI, G D'AMICO	78
Alcohol consumption and the risk of alcohol related cirrhosis in women	ROBYN NORTON, ROBERT BATEY, TERENCE DWYER, STEPHEN MACMAHON	80
Death rates from stroke in England and Wales predicted from past maternal mortality	D J P BARKER, C OSMOND	83
Type A behaviour and ischaemic heart disease in middle aged British men	D W JOHNSTON, D G COOK, A G SHAPER	86
Lethal malformations and perinatal mortality: a 10 year review with comparison of ethnic differences	I D YOUNG, M CLARKE	89
Prognosis of subsequent pregnancies after recurrent spontaneous abortion in first trimester	WILLEM VLAANDEREN, PIETER E TREFFERS	92
Endoscopic injection of alcohol for bleeding from gastroduodenal vascular anomalies	JAMES D R ROSE	93
Safety and acceptability of condoms for use by homosexual men as a prophylactic against transmission of HIV during anogenital sexual intercourse	LODE WIGERSMA, RON OUD	94
Alcohol and death certification: a survey of current practice and attitudes	GARY BELL, ANNE CREMONA	95
Doctors have no time for alcohol screening	N ROWLAND, A MAYNARD, A BEVERIDGE, P KENNEDY, W WINTERSGILL, W STONE	95
Successful treatment of infertility due to polycystic ovary disease using a combination of luteinising hormone releasing hormone agonist and low dosage menotrophin	MARY ARMITAGE, TERENCE WILKIN, KEITH DEWBURY	96
Simultaneous primary infection with varicella zoster and Epstein-Barr viruses	JAN BILLHEDEN, BENGT HILL, PER JUTO, BO SETTERGREN, BIRGER TROLLFORS	97
Delusional depression after infectious mononucleosis	P D WHITE, S W LEWIS	97
Unorthodox internal fixation of bone lesions in myelomatosis	ALENA KUBIE, P I BUSFIELD, R P BRITT	98
How to create and maintain an age-sex register	F M SULLIVAN, ROSEMARY C EAGERS, KATHERINE LYNCH	99

MEDICAL PRACTICE

Drinking and driving: success of random breath testing in Finland	JAMES A DUNBAR, ANTTI PENTTILA, JARMO PIKKARAINEN	101
ABC of AIDS: Nursing care	JACQUI ELLIOTT	104
What is a Good Consultant?: A worm's eye view	D F NEWTON	106
Portraits from Memory: 17—Sir Walter Russell Brain, FRS, PRCP (later Lord Brain)	SIR JAMES HOWIE	108
Incidence of unsuspected fractures in traumatic effusions of the elbow joint	D J W MOREWOOD	109
Any Questions?		103
Materia Non Medica—Contributions from PHILIP H SUTTON, PATRICK MORRISON		107
Medicine and Books		111
Personal View	JOHN H JAMES	115

CORRESPONDENCE—List of Contents 116

OBITUARY 126

NEWS AND NOTES

Views	123
Medical News	124
BMA Notices	125

SUPPLEMENT

The Week in Bristol	127
Vital to talk to patients, urges president	153
Parliament's moral agenda	JOHN WARDEN 154

CORRESPONDENCE

Suffocation and videos A S David, MRCPsych, and M Farrell, MRCP; J E Oliver, FRCPsych 116	Infection by airborne Chlamydia trachomatis M Viswalingam, MB, and others 119	Persistent mesenteric ischaemia in a young woman G G Hartnell, MRCP 121
Halothane hepatitis in children D W Noble, FFARCS; E F Battersby, FFARCS, and others; G W Black, FFARCS, and others; H J Wark, FFARCS; J Neuberger, MRCP, and others 117	Successful treatment of asymptomatic endometriosis: Does it benefit infertile women? K Bancroft, MB, and others 119	Health and efficiency J T Winkler 121
ABC of AIDS: Neurological manifestations R E Holliman, MB, and D G Fleck, FRCPATH 118	General practice consultations K Hopayian, MRCP; K B Thomas, MD 120	Vacancy advertisements M J Bell, MRCP 121
Not all travellers need immunoglobulin for hepatitis A G Kudesia, MRCPATH, and E A C Follett, MRCPATH 118	Regional secure units: arriving but under threat S Brandon, FRCPsych, and J Earp, MRCPsych 120	Points Screening for hypertension (M H Brooks); Screening for hearing loss in childhood (H Thomson and M Brockbank); Pacemakers on board ship (C P Lau and others); Is smoking a risk factor for pneumonia in adults with chickenpox? (A F Knyvett); Unemployment and child abuse (L S Taitz); Hospices for children? (S L Goodman); Services for people with epilepsy (A R Nicol and R A Collacott); Health information from Air Call (P R Gregory); Lies, damned lies, and statistics (J E Horrocks) 122
Infantile apnoea and home monitoring P G F Swift, FRCP; D M Reid, MRCP 118	Refusal to treat AIDS and HIV positive patients D N H Greig, FRCP 120	
Penetration of antibiotics into the respiratory tract D C Currie, MRCP, and others 119	Promoting prevention in primary care G Fowler, FRCP, and others 121	

- All letters must be typed with double spacing and signed by all authors.
- No letter should be more than 400 words.
- For letters on scientific subjects we normally reserve our correspondence columns for those relating to issues discussed recently (within six weeks) in the *BMJ*.
- We do not routinely acknowledge letters. Please send a stamped addressed envelope if you would like an acknowledgment.
- Because we receive many more letters than we can publish we may shorten those we do print, particularly when we receive several on the same subject.

Suffocation and videos

SIR,—Professor Roy Meadow's leading article (27 June, p 1629) highlights many constructive uses to which video technology can be put. However, many other aspects are ignored and in view of current intense media interest in child sex abuse this may lead to misunderstandings. We have recently examined some of the ethical dilemmas associated with the use of video recording¹ and write now as observers, not self appointed experts, which this subject seems to attract.

Many child psychiatrists use videos routinely as part of their clinical work and for teaching. Some now find themselves as reluctant witnesses in court proceedings. The BMA and medical defence societies have issued recommendations that video tapes should be regarded in the same way as written notes, with the same rules of confidentiality (that is, until they are subpoenaed) and similar regulations precluding erasure—the latter being totally impractical by reason of expense and lack of storage space. Professor Meadow sidesteps these issues, as he does the matter of consent, and ignores the question of who should carry out video recorded interviews: the police, the clinicians concerned, social workers, or independent psychiatrists? Is this likely to be in the interest of the child, the police, the family, or society? Finally, there seems to be a widespread need to deny that sexual abuse has its roots in family life, and there is a danger that it is seen as a purely criminal matter which the legal system, with the help of cooperative doctors, can eradicate. Talk of diagnosing (sic) sexual abuse feeds into this. Though physical signs may be detected in a minority of cases, child sex abuse is no more a diagnosis than, say, murder or neglect. It is usually

one aspect, albeit a particularly distressing one, of general deprivation and it is that which we should seek to eradicate.

A S DAVID
M FARRELL

Maudsley Hospital,
London SE5 8AZ

1 David T, Farrell M. Child sex abuse under the spotlight. *Maudsley and Bethlem Gazette* 1987;34:22-3.

SIR,—The last paragraph of the important paper by Dr D P Southall and colleagues (27 June, p 1637) ends, "smothering is a comparatively rare but dangerous and preventable cause of hypoxaemic episodes in young children." The behaviour shown by their two mothers is uncommon, but I doubt that it is rare.

In our 1985 report on young children abused in north east Wiltshire we described 39 such child victims who suffered at least 58 suffocatory assaults.¹ Four of the children had been held under water and 13 suffered throttling or strangling (often to the point of unconsciousness); but the remaining 22 were assaulted in ways comparable to those described by Dr Southall and colleagues. In my *BMJ* paper of 1983 at least 34 of the main group of 513 abused children had been subjected to suffocatory techniques, and I described a characteristic vignette of a mother whose behaviour differed from the maternal behaviour described by the authors only because she reacted in stress and anger whereas their two mothers practised calculated bouts of suffocation of their babies. As with their two cases, all our child

victims of suffocatory assaults had parents who themselves had been victims of child abuse.²

Professor Roy Meadow (p 1629) rightly identifies the child victim as the primary patient but favours medical confrontation with mothers where the diagnostic probability is strong *before* involving the police and secret video recordings, as do Dr Southall and his team. It is hard to follow this logic, which seems to put a tremendous burden on the paediatrician, excludes the police at a crucial stage, and sidetracks the courts. Long term efforts to protect the child would be undermined, leaving as the only option years of unremittingly sustained first class social and medical therapy without the authority to enforce such treatments. Professor Meadow nevertheless goes on to support the case for allowing secret video recordings where there is diagnostic uncertainty.

Following the Beckford inquiry the DHSS draft guidelines on child abuse contained totally inadequate definitions of child abuse. I and the Wiltshire child protection committee have written letters complaining about this, making particular mention of the failure of the DHSS even to be aware of suffocatory episodes being a form of physical abuse, let alone a (not rare) form of abuse that leaves no evidence.

J E OLIVER

Pewsey Hospital,
Pewsey,
Wiltshire SN9 5NQ

- 1 Oliver JE, Graham WJ. *Generations of maltreated children in north east Wiltshire*. Oxford: Oxford University Unit of Clinical Epidemiology, 1985.
- 2 Oliver JE. Dead children from problem families in north east Wiltshire. *Br Med J* 1983;286:115-7.